

*Winnipeg Indigenous
Executive Circle*

**State of
Equity in
Education
Report
2023**



Executive Summary

The State of Equity in Education Report aims to promote evidence-based strategies for developing and implementing equity-based education policies and programs for the Indigenous students enrolled in the public schools in the city of Winnipeg. A guiding principle of the Report is that to improve educational outcomes for Indigenous students, they must see themselves better reflected in the curriculum and all staff positions within the public education system.

The Report is deliberately focussed on a narrow range of issues, including the underrepresentation of First Nations, Métis and Inuit peoples on school boards, as staff within public schools, and as students within the faculties of education.

Depth rather than breadth is the strategic approach the Report takes to best monitor the action and progress made on these critical areas of concern. Unfortunately, as documented in the 2020 State of Equity in Education Report, the history of developing reports on issues of equity-based education has been long on rhetoric and short on achieving measurable outcomes. Instead, concrete and authentic change comes from addressing deeply embedded systemic issues of colonialism and racism, engaging in difficult conversations, and being transparent and accountable to the community.

It is once again encouraging to learn about the progress that some school divisions have made over the past year to begin to implement equity-based education initiatives such as student and



“If more kids see more teachers that are Indigenous, if they see parts of themselves in the teacher, then that will encourage them to pursue what they want or pursue that same career they see Indigenous people in. It will inspire more Indigenous students.”

Dylan
Indigenous Youth Voice

workforce surveys, acknowledge the critical role of independent equity audits, and make public commitments to support the development and implementation of education equity offices.

The third annual 2022 State of Equity in Education Report will highlight the extent to which the provincial government, school divisions, and the faculties of education have been listening to community voices based on their institutional responses to date to the Calls To Action in the 2021 State of Equity in Education Report.

Each State of Equity in Education Report is a living document that provides an annual update on how the equity-based education issues identified in the Calls To Action of the previous year are being addressed. A new set of Calls to Action will also be presented in each subsequent annual State of Equity in Education Report released by the Winnipeg Indigenous Executive Circle.

The third annual 2022 State of Equity in Education Report was developed based on the themes of the survey response

data provided in January 2023 by the provincial government, the six school divisions in the city of Winnipeg, including the Louis Riel School Division; Pembina Trails School Division; River East-Transcona School Division; St. James-Assiniboia School Division; Seven Oaks School Division; and Winnipeg School Division; and the faculties of education at the universities of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Saint-Boniface, and Brandon. The findings of the Report will be presented to school divisions, faculties of education, provincial department of education, and released to the general public.

The Report will be structured in the following manner:

1. Review the response to the calls to action of the 2021 State of Equity in Education Report;
2. Present the results of the 2022 State of Equity in Education Report survey of the six school divisions within Winnipeg and the four faculties of education that graduate teachers to work in Winnipeg schools; and
3. Identify Calls to Action for the upcoming year.

Background of Organization

The Winnipeg Indigenous Executive Circle was formed in 2015 and represents Indigenous Executive Directors of Indigenous-led organizations with a mandate to enhance policies, service delivery and systems so that they are more responsive to the needs and perspectives of First Nations, Métis, and Inuit peoples in the city of Winnipeg.

The Winnipeg Indigenous Executive Circle has identified four priorities in its strategic plan, including:

- Education, Training, Employment and Economic Development;
 - Access to Housing;
 - Supporting and Strengthening Families; and
 - Health and Well-being
- The State of Equity in Education Report is guided by the Education Committee of the Indigenous Executive Circle chaired by Heather McCormick of the Centre for Aboriginal Human Resource Development.

Response to Calls to Action of 2021 State of Equity in Education Report

In November 2022, a survey was sent to the provincial government, school divisions and faculties of education to get their response about the work they have undertaken to address the calls to action identified in the 2021 State of Equity in Education Report.

Table 1: Calls To Action Survey Responses from School Divisions

Table 1 summarizes the responses from the six Winnipeg school divisions. The response categories in the 2022 survey include: (1) Implemented; (2) Not Yet Implemented; (3) No Plan To Implement; (4) Supporting; (5) Not Yet Supporting; and (6) Not Supporting. The school division coding for the table is: LRSD – Louis Riel School Division; PTSD – Pembina Trails School Division; RETSD – River East Transcona School Division; SJASD – St. James Assiniboia School Division; SOSD – Seven Oaks School Division; and WSD – Winnipeg School Division.

Call To Action	LRSD	PTSD	RETSD	SJASD	SOSD	WSD
Establish education equity office.	Implemented	No Plan to Implement	No Plan to Implement	Not Yet Implemented	No Plan to Implement	Not Yet Implemented
Implement external equity audit.	Not Yet Implemented	No Plan to Implement	Not Yet Implemented	Not Yet Implemented	No Plan to Implement	Not Yet Implemented
Implement annual employee self-identification survey.	Implemented	No Plan to Implement	Implemented	Implemented	No Plan to Implement	Implemented
Produce annual employment equity reports accessible to the public.	Not Yet Implemented	No Plan to Implement	Not Yet Implemented	Not Yet Implemented	No Plan to Implement	Implemented
Implement regular student and parent surveys of community demographics.	Implemented	No Plan to Implement	Not Yet Implemented	Not Yet Implemented	Implemented	Implemented
Collect disaggregated student data for suspensions, absenteeism, graduation rates, credit accumulation, representation in applied and academic courses.	Implemented	Plan to Implement	Not Yet Implemented	Not Yet Implemented	Implemented	Implemented
Change multi-trustee ward system to one trustee/one ward system.	No Plan to Implement	No Plan to Implement	No Plan to Implement	No Plan to Implement	No Plan to Implement	Implemented
Board of trustees adopt a consensus decision-making model rather than majority-rule decision-making model.	No Plan to Implement	No Plan to Implement	No Plan to Implement	No Plan to Implement	Implemented	No Plan to Implement

Call To Action	LRSD	PTSD	RETSD	SJASD	SOSD	WSD
Support Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy to provide laddering opportunities to enter B.Ed programs.	Not Yet Supporting	Supporting	Supporting	Supporting	Supporting	Supporting
Support partnering with Indigenous organizations to develop B.Ed in Indigenous Knowledges program.	Not Yet Supporting	Supporting	Supporting	Supporting	Supporting	Not Yet Supporting

Table 2: Calls to Action Survey Responses from Faculties of Education

Table 2 summarizes the responses of the four universities that provide Bachelor of Education graduates for schools in the city of Winnipeg. The faculty of education coding for the table is: U of M – University of Manitoba; U of W – University of Winnipeg; U of St. B– Université de Saint-Boniface; and BU – Brandon University.

Call To Action	U of M	U of W	U of St. B	BU
Set equity enrollment targets for Indigenous B. Ed. students.	Implemented	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	No Plan to Implement
Publicly release annual Indigenous student enrollment data.	No Plan to Implement	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Not Yet Implemented
Publicly release annual Indigenous student graduation data.	No Plan to Implement	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Plan to Implement
Implement annual employment equity report disaggregated by Indigenous employees at the faculty.	Implemented	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	No Plan to Implement
Publicly release annual employment equity report.	Not Yet Implemented	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	No Plan to Implement
Support Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy to provide laddering opportunities to enter B.Ed programs.	No Plan to Support	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Supporting
Support partnering with Indigenous organizations to develop B.Ed in Indigenous Knowledges program.	No Plan to Support	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Not Yet Supporting

Table 3: Calls To Action Survey Response from the Province of Manitoba

Call To Action	Province of Manitoba
Implement equity-based reports, data collection, and policies within public schools that are accessible to the public.	Implemented
Establish a provincial Education Equity Secretariat.	Not Yet Implemented
Publish on a 3-year period basis self-identification and teacher survey data for Indigenous peoples broken down by individual school district.	Implemented
Supporting Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy by partnering with Indigenous organizations to develop B.Ed in Indigenous Knowledges program.	Supporting

Calls To Action of School Division Employment Equity

Establish Education Equity Office: One school division indicated that they have implemented this call to action; two school divisions indicated they have not yet implemented this call to action; and three school divisions indicated they have no plan to implement this call to action.

Implement External Equity Audit: Four school divisions indicated they have not yet implemented this call to action, and two school divisions indicated they have no plan to implement this call to action.

Implement Annual Employee Self-Identification Survey: Four school divisions have implemented this call to action, and two school divisions have no plan to implement this call to action.

Produce Annual Employment Equity Reports Accessible to the Public: One school division indicated they have implemented this call to action; three school divisions have indicated that they have not yet implemented this call to action; and two school divisions indicated they have no plan to implement this call to action.

Implement Regular Student and Parent Surveys of Community Demographics: Three school divisions indicated that they have implemented this call to action; two school divisions have not yet implemented this call to action; and one school division has no plan to implement this call to action.

These Calls to Action for employment equity policies and

practices (1) support school divisions to work towards the development of a workforce that is representative of the students being served; (2) promote accountability; and (3) fosters transparency. The gap between the number of Indigenous and/or racialized teachers working in public schools in Winnipeg and the student population being served is an issue that is not unique to our community. It is a structural issue faced by school divisions across Canada and the United States.

Equity-based data collection regarding this issue is not well-documented in Canada. In contrast, the federal Department of Education in the United States publishes a Characteristics of Public and Private Elementary and Secondary School Teachers Report every two years. The most recent report published in 2020 for the 2017/2018 survey results indicates that 79% of the teachers are white; 77% of the teachers are female; 7% are black; and 2% of the teachers are black males. In addition, the report identifies a significant gap between teacher workforce representation concerning the students being served, as 53% of the students are persons of colour.

This structural inequity requires a long-term and sustainable systemic approach. Equity infrastructure within school districts provides a base for this type of leadership to facilitate capacity building throughout an organization. Education equity offices are catalysts to promote equity and accountability within a school district; Louis Riel School Division has established a Superintendent of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion and Anti-Racism Services within its school district to provide leadership to ensure the whole organization engages with equity-based education. In addition, the Board of Trustees of the Winnipeg School Divi-

sion established an Education Equity Advisory Committee to make recommendations to the board about the key elements of an Education Equity Office that will be established by April 30, 2023.

In June 2020, the Ontario government took over running the Peel District School Board (PDSB), the second largest school division in the country, in response to the school board's inability to address issues of systemic racism identified in the external provincial review of the school district.

The review highlighted the essential role of employment equity policy and programs. The report stated "a detailed Employment Systems Review (ESR) is an irreplaceable best practice used to ferret out barriers to equity in workplace cultures, policies, procedures and practices. Indeed, without a thorough ESR, it is difficult to understand how the Board of Trustees can properly establish accountabilities, goals and timetables necessary to conduct fair and transparent equity hiring."

Third-party independent reviews of the financial operations of non-profit and publicly funded organizations through annual financial audits are standard practice for good governance, accountability and transparency. Equity audits and Employment Systems Reviews play this same best practice stewardship function for an organization's human resource practices. Without a third-party independent review that develops feedback from various vantage points within and outside the organization, the leadership in governance and senior management roles "do not know what it does not know," especially regarding employment equity-related issues.

Over the past year, Equity Matters, along with five Winnipeg metro school divisions and the provincial department of education, sponsored two webinars on the role of equity audits to promote awareness and knowledge within the education community regarding the role of equity audits to support the development of data/evidence to guide organizational change. Tana Turner from the Turner Consulting Group was the keynote speaker for this webinar series. The Turner Consulting Group has conducted almost 50 equity audits to date for school boards, municipalities and public organizations in the province of Ontario. Over 200 educational leaders and stakeholders attended the webinars. The Winnipeg School Division engaged the Turner Consulting Group to do an equity audit for its school district, which will be completed in the spring of 2023. Other school districts have indicated an interest in engaging in this important element of education equity organizational development practice.

It is important to note that the Manitoba Teacher's Society

(MTS) has also acknowledged the important role of third-party audits in promoting equity-based change within their organization. In May 2022, the MTS launched an Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion (EDI) Scan with EDI consultants from the University of Victoria, Dr. Catherine McGregor and Dr. Grace Wong Sneddon, to identify and redress internal barriers regarding equity-based issues. The EDI scan will include an internal audit of the staffing and leadership demographics, organizational policies and practices of the MTS, and an external audit of membership and leadership demographics, organizational policies, practices and experiences of the membership.

A positive development over this past year is the work by a number of school divisions to undertake or plan to implement workforce self-identification surveys. This is an important first step in strategically planning to develop a workforce representative of the students being served by school divisions. However, a more comprehensive equity-based human resource practice is to engage external third-party independent resource groups to conduct equity audits and external system reviews.

Accountability and transparency are two key foundational equity-based employment policy and practice issues. Along with implementing external equity audits, workforce self-identification surveys, employment systems reviews, and setting employment equity targets proportionate to the Indigenous students being served by school divisions, local school districts must ensure that annual employment equity reports are produced that are accessible to the public. These annual employment equity reports provide parents and citizens of the community an update on the progress being made, the challenges encountered, and plans of action to achieve the identified employment equity program goals and objectives.

Call To Action For School Divisions Regarding Student Equity

[Collect Disaggregated Student Data for Suspensions, Absenteeism, Graduation Rates, Credit Accumulation, Representation in Applied and Academic Courses:](#) Three school divisions have implemented this call to action.

Two of the six school divisions collect disaggregated data, including self-identified Indigenous students, for student suspensions. Three of the six school divisions collect disaggregated data for student absenteeism. Six of the six school divisions collect disaggregated data for student graduation. Five of the six school divisions collect disaggregated data for student credit accumulation. Four of the six school divisions collect disaggregated data for student representation in applied and academic courses. Two of

the six school divisions collect data for student representation in special needs programs.

The collection of disaggregated student equity data enables educators to identify issues and engage in problem-solving regarding the impacts of colonization and systemic racism on Indigenous students that shift understanding from an individual incident or event level of analysis to a structural level of analysis. It moves beyond examining what students have to do differently and looks more at what systems need to do to change to meet the aspirations and needs of Indigenous students authentically.

Calls To Action For School Divisions Regarding School Governance

Change Multi-Trustee Ward System to One Trustee/One Ward System:

One school division has implemented this call to action; and five school divisions have indicated that they have no plan to implement this call to action.

School Board Adopts Consensus Decision-Making Model Rather Than Majority Rule Decision-Making Approach:

One school division has implemented this call to action; four school divisions have no plan to implement this call to action; and one school division did not respond to this call to action.

The 2020 State of Equity in Education Report indicated that 2 of the 54 school trustees self-identify as Indigenous. These 2 school trustees were elected in one school division, while the other 5 school divisions had no Indigenous representation on their respective school boards.

The 2021 State of Equity in Education Report indicated that 5 of the 54 school trustees self-identify as Indigenous. Four of these trustees were elected in one school division, one was elected in another school division, while the other 4 school divisions had no Indigenous representation on their respective school boards.

The 2022 State of Equity in Education Report indicates that 8 of the 54 school trustees self-identify as Indigenous. One school division has three self-identified Indigenous trustees; one school division has two self-identified Indigenous trustees; three school divisions have one self-identified trustee; and one school division has no Indigenous school trustees.

The 2020 State of Equity in Education Report identified the underlying colonial dynamic of school governance,

where First Nations, Métis and Inuit representation at the decision-making tables is missing. Hart and Rowe (2014) define colonialism as:

The evolving process where we, as peoples of this land, face impositions – from genocide to assimilation, to marginalization – of views, beliefs, values and practices, lands and/or resources. It is when we, as peoples of this land, are stopped, hindered, cajoled, and/or manipulated from making and enacting decisions about our lives, individually and as a group, because of being a person of the peoples of this land. These decisions include how we are going to be who we are, and how, if at all, we are going to incorporate the ideas, beliefs, values and practices of other peoples (P.35).

Iris Young's (1990) concept of non-distributive justice brings further attention to the impact of inclusion and exclusion in the decision-making structures such as local school boards. She looks at how decision-making structures enact and reproduce their colonial power. Existing justice perspectives that focus on the distribution of rights, opportunities and resources fail to bring issues of decision-making power and representation under evaluation. These non-distributive dynamics causally condition the distribution of resources. Critical questions to ask, therefore, when identifying sources of colonial domination within social relations in society, include: (1) who is included and why; (2) who is excluded and why; and (3) what are the barriers to representation involving issues of power, decision-making, and the allocation of rights, opportunities, and resources.

Calls to Action on the More Indigenous Teachers Initiative

Support Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy To Provide Laddering Opportunities To Enter Bachelor of Education Programs:

Five school divisions are supporting this call to action, and one school division is not yet supporting this call to action.

Support Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy To Partner with Indigenous Organizations to Develop Bachelor of Education in Indigenous Knowledges Program: Four school divisions are supporting this call to action, and two school divisions are not yet supporting this call to action.

The Winnipeg Indigenous Executive Circle (WIEC) hosted a stakeholder working group meeting in September 2021 and presented an Indigenous Teacher

Education Strategy that focussed on building the pool of Indigenous peoples interested in becoming teachers through a job training program; developing a laddering program for these students to obtain a Bachelor of Education degree upon completion of the job training program; and developing a laddering program for existing Indigenous educational assistants to obtain their Bachelor of Education degree.

A significant challenge faced by the faculties of education in their efforts to scale up the number of Indigenous B.Ed. graduates is building a larger pool of Indigenous peoples in the city of Winnipeg who are interested in becoming teachers. The 2020 State of Equity in Education Report indicated an underrepresentation of 600 to 700 Indigenous teachers in the city of Winnipeg schools. On average, the faculties of education at the University of Manitoba and University of Winnipeg have graduated 35 Indigenous B. Ed. graduates between these two institutions each year for the past two decades. At this rate, it will take almost 20 years to address the underrepresentation of Indigenous teachers in Winnipeg.

WIEC maintains that the faculties of education will not be able to address this challenge on their own. There needs to be a partnership involving Indigenous organizations, school divisions, faculties of education, and the provincial and federal governments working together strategically to increase the number of Indigenous B.Ed. graduates.

This could include establishing a Bachelor of Education in Indigenous Knowledges (similar to the already existing Masters of Social Work in Indigenous Knowledges program at the University of Manitoba) operated by an existing Indigenous academic organization such as Neeginan College (similar to the precedent set by the Bachelor of Social Work program offered by the Salvation Army's Booth University College).

An additional challenge that needs to be addressed is the absence of student living allowances and tuition bursaries that would enable prospective students to attend Bachelor of Education programs full-time. This is a challenge faced by students attending the existing Community Aboriginal Teacher Education Program (CATEP) at the University of Winnipeg. Participants of this program work as educational assistants in several Winnipeg school divisions. They attend the CATEP B.Ed. program part-time at night and on weekends, and go on Employment Insurance for May to August to attend the program full-time. This program approach can take up to 8 years to complete, which is very demanding on stu-

dents who are working full-time, raising a family, and going to school. Between 2015 and 2021, on a yearly average, CATEP had 8 Indigenous students graduate with a Bachelor of Education degree.

A key strategy for WIEC's proposed Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy is to negotiate with the federal government to provide urban Indigenous organizations with funding for student living allowances and tuition bursaries so students can go to school full-time. The federal government previously provided this type of funding for students attending the Bachelor of Education and Bachelor of Social Work programs at the Winnipeg Education Centre. If the number of Indigenous B.Ed. students is to be scaled up in the city of Winnipeg, similar resources will be required.

The proposed Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy would involve three components:

1. The federal government would expand funding to the Centre for Aboriginal Human Resource Development (CAHRD), the local Indigenous Skills Employment and Training (ISET) federal program holder in Winnipeg, to offer a one-year job training program for up to 100 participants per year for a five-year period (500 jobs in total) for Indigenous parents and adult learning centre participants to be Community Teacher Service Workers. These participants would be placed in teams of 5 individuals in 20 urban schools that have large numbers of Indigenous students. Program participants would be provided upgrading and transition support, along with work placement experiences in a school setting.
2. Graduates of the Community Teacher Service Worker program would be laddered into a Bachelor of Education in Indigenous Knowledges program operated by Neeginan College. Federal funding for living allowances and tuition bursaries would be provided to support participants to attend school on a full-time basis. There would be 25 students per year enrolled in the program, and 5 cohorts of the program would be offered over a 9-year period for a total of 125 students.
3. Educational Assistant Laddering Program to Bachelor of Education in Indigenous Knowledges operated by Neeginan College for existing Indigenous Educational Assistants who are interested in going to school on a full-time basis. A student living allowance and tuition bursaries would be funded by the federal government. There would be 25 students per year enrolled in the program, and 5 cohorts of the program would be offered over a 9-year period, for a total of 125 students.

Over the past year, the Centre for Aboriginal Human Resource Development (CAHRD) successfully secured funding from the federal government for \$11 million over a 5-year period for the one-year job training program component of the Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy. All six metro Winnipeg school divisions have formally agreed to partner with this initiative to hire Indigenous parents and Indigenous participants in adult learning centres to provide work placements for the Community Teacher Service Worker training program. The first cohort of this program will start in September 2023.

CAHRD also held several meetings this past year with a Manitoba post-secondary institution to explore the feasibility of a partnership to establish a Bachelor of Education in Indigenous Knowledges degree program with Neeginan College. Preliminary conversations were held with the Minister of Education and Early Childhood Training about this proposed initiative. Ongoing negotiations will take place with the post-secondary institution and the provincial government to develop a formal proposal for the program. As well, negotiations are underway to explore the feasibility of how the federal government could support the Bachelor of Education in Indigenous Knowledges degree program through living allowance and bursary funding support.

Calls to Action on Student Equity Data Collection – Faculties of Education

Student Equity enrollment targets for Indigenous B.Ed. students: One of the faculties indicated that it has implemented this call to action (University of Manitoba has a 15% target for annual enrollment); one faculty has no plan to implement this call to action; and two faculties did not respond to this call to action. Without setting targets, intentional progress cannot be achieved, monitored, or evaluated, which would promote transparency and accountability of publicly funded institutions.

Publicly release annual Indigenous enrollment data: One faculty indicated that it has not yet implemented this call to action; one faculty has no plan to implement this call to action; and two faculties did not respond to this call to action. Without public transparency, these publicly funded institutions cannot be held accountable for what they are doing well, and for areas that require further improvement.

Publicly release annual Indigenous student

graduation data: One faculty indicated that they plan to implement this call to action; one faculty has no plan to implement this call to action; and two faculties did not respond to this call to action. This type of data collection is important for equity-based workforce planning and development in identifying the magnitude of the challenge regarding Indigenous teacher shortages in our province. Without public transparency, accountability to address critical needs in the community is not present, institutions drift, and change does not take place.

Calls to Action on Employment Equity Data Collection – Faculties of Education

Annual employment equity report disaggregated by Indigenous employees at the faculty: One faculty indicated that it has implemented this call to action; one faculty has no plan to implement this call to action; and two faculties did not respond to this call to action. Intentional change will not occur if evidenced-based data is not collected to measure results, promote transparency, and provide accountability for these publicly funded institutions.

Publicly release annual employment equity report: One faculty indicated they have not yet implemented this call to action; one faculty has no plan to implement this call to action; and two faculties did not respond to this call to action. Other publicly funded institutions regularly release employment equity reports to the public annually. A commitment to equity-based education requires transparency so that the community can monitor the progress or the lack of progress made by publicly-funded institutions.

Calls to Action on Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy – Faculties of Education

Support Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy to provide laddering opportunities to enter Bachelor of Education programs: One faculty indicated that it is supporting this call to action; one faculty has no plans to support this call to action; and two faculties did not respond to this call to action. A key challenge that faculties of education face is to build the pool of Indigenous peoples who would be interested in becoming teachers. The faculties of education will not be able to do this on their own. They need to work in collaboration with Indigenous organizations, school divisions, and the federal government to build community-based laddering pro-

grams that would expand the pool of Indigenous peoples interested in becoming teachers to move beyond the number of Indigenous students graduating from the B.Ed. programs for the past number of decades.

Support partnering with Indigenous organizations to develop a B.Ed in Indigenous Knowledges

program: One faculty indicated that it is not yet supporting this call to action; one faculty has no plan to support this call to action; and two faculties did not respond to this call to action. A broader range of pathways to get a Bachelor of Education degree is required to address the severe shortage of Indigenous teachers in the city of Winnipeg. Decolonizing post-secondary education will require working in solidarity with Indigenous organizations to support greater self-determination through tangibly supporting the aspirations of the First Nations, Métis and Inuit peoples to provide locally controlled education that is rooted in Indigenous knowledges, pedagogies, ways of knowing and ways of being.

Calls to Action for the Manitoba Government

Implement equity-based reports, data collection, and policies within public schools that are accessible to the public: The provincial government has indicated that it has implemented this call to action. Further evidence will need to be provided by the provincial government regarding the range and depth of their work in this area, and the level of transparency and access that the public has to this data and documents. A concrete example would involve the collection of racialized data and the leadership required to ensure public schools and post-secondary institutions are collecting and publicly releasing this type of data. The Ontario government's Anti-Racist Education Secretariat developed a "Data Standards for Identification and Monitoring of Systemic Racism." The Manitoba provincial government must play a similar concrete role involving equity-based data collection and reporting.

Establish provincial Education Equity Secretariat: The provincial government has indicated that it has not yet implemented an Education Equity Secretariat. Equity Matters has outlined the key elements of a provincial Education Equity Secretariat. Adopting these concrete components of an Education Equity Secretariat would demonstrate an authentic commitment to provide the required infrastructure to address education equity in a long-term and sustainable manner in our province.

Publish on a 3-year period basis self-identification

and teacher survey data for Indigenous peoples broken down by individual school districts: The provincial government indicated that it has implemented this call to action. The most recent self-identification Indigenous teacher survey was initiated in the fall of 2022. This type of data is invaluable to have some benchmarks to measure the representation of Indigenous teachers in schools in our province, and to develop a broader range of pathways to address the shortage of Indigenous teachers in our province.

Supporting Indigenous Teacher Education Strategy by partnering with Indigenous organizations to develop a Bachelor of Education in Indigenous Knowledges program: The provincial government has indicated that it will support this initiative to expand pathways for Indigenous peoples to become teachers.

Data Collection for Report

In November 2022, WIEC sent out surveys for the third annual State of Equity in Education Report to each of the six school divisions in the city of Winnipeg; the faculties of education at the University of Manitoba, University of Winnipeg, Université Saint-Boniface, and Brandon University; and the provincial department of education. The findings of this report are based on the data collected from these surveys.

Table 4: School Trustee Profile and Representation – 2018 Election and 2022 Election Findings – School Division Survey School Trustee Representation

All of six metro Winnipeg school divisions completed the school trustee Indigenous self-identification survey question of the State of Equity in Education Report.

School Division	Number of Trustees	2020 Survey Number of Indigenous Trustees Elected 2018	%	2021 Survey Number of Indigenous Trustees Elected 2018	%	2022 Survey Number of Indigenous Trustees Elected 2022	%
Louis Riel	9	0	0%	0	0%	1	11%
Pembina Trails	9	0	0%	0	0%	2	22%
River East Transcona	9	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%
St. James Assiniboia	9	0	0%	1	11%	1	11%
Seven Oaks	9	0	0%	0	0%	1	11%
Winnipeg School Division	9	2	22%	4	44%	3	33%
Total	54	2	4%	5	9%	8	15%

The school trustee profile and representation based on the results of the 2018 school board elections in the city of Winnipeg indicates Indigenous peoples are underrepresented at the highest level of policy and program decision-making within the public school system in our community. The 2020 State of Equity in Education survey indicated that only the Winnipeg School Division school board had Indigenous school trustees, and the other five school divisions had no Indigenous representation on their respective school boards. The 2021 State of Equity in Education Report survey indicates that the Winnipeg School Division had 4 school trustees self-identifying as Indigenous, and the St. James-Assiniboia School Division had 1 school trustee self-identifying as an Indigenous person.

The 2022 State of Equity Report survey indicates that the number of school trustees that self-identified as Indigenous has increased from 5 trustees in the 2021 Report to 8 trustees or 15% of the total number of school trustees in the third annual Report based on the results of the

school board elections that took place in October 2022.

The Louis Riel School Division increased from 0 self-identified Indigenous school trustees to 1; Pembina Trails School Division increased from 0 to 2; River East Transcona School Division remained the same at no self-identified Indigenous school trustees; St. James-Assiniboia remained the same at 1 self-identified school trustee; Seven Oaks School Division increased from 0 to 1; and the Winnipeg School Division decreased from 4 self-identified Indigenous school trustees to 3.

The increase in the number of self-identified Indigenous school trustees means that now five of the six school divisions in the city of Winnipeg have Indigenous representation at the school board decision-making tables to provide a voice for the Indigenous community regarding decisions involving the distribution of rights, resources, opportunities, and the prioritization of issues. To further the participatory decision-making process, school boards could adopt consensus decision-making processes as

opposed to the traditional majority rule decision-making model to ensure decisions are made that are inclusive and equitable, rather than by using approaches that do not always represent the needs and interests of the minority. Given the increased representation of Indigenous school trustees in five of the six school divisions in Winnipeg, it would be important for these leaders to have more opportunities to support each other and identify key strategic Indigenous education issues that need to be addressed. The formation of an urban Indigenous school trustee caucus that meets regularly could provide a vehicle to strengthen the presence of Indigenous voices at the school board level.

The recent 2022 school board election in the Winnipeg School Division highlighted the impact of the absence of election finance legislation at the school board level of governance that serves to prevent individuals and corporate interests, both inside and outside the province, from influencing school board elections. The federal, provincial, and municipal levels of government have election financing regulations to ensure elections are fair. Provincial election financing legislation is required for the school board level of governance to also ensure they have these same protections to preserve the integrity of the local democratic process.

Shortage of Indigenous Teachers in the City of Winnipeg

The Province of Manitoba has previously conducted the Manitoba Indigenous Teacher Education Survey (MITES) every three years to collect data about the number of self-identified Indigenous teachers in the province. The most recently published MITES is based on the 2017 survey. The province has undertaken a new MITES in the fall of 2022 and will be made public in the spring of 2023.

The State of Equity in Education Report cross-references the MITES data with the Indigenous Self-Identification Student Data in Manitoba Schools collected by the Province of Manitoba regarding self-identified students to provide a profile of Indigenous teacher representation in schools in Winnipeg.

A key guiding principle of the State of Equity in Education Report is that to improve educational outcomes for Indigenous students, they need to see themselves better reflected in the curriculum and at all staff levels in the public school system. One of the concrete steps that could be taken by local school divisions to meet this objective would be to adopt an employment benchmark approach



“If kids see an Indigenous teacher in the classroom, they’ll be like

‘Oh! I can be that!’

They can become anything they want.”

Summer
Indigenous Youth Voice

that seeks to ensure the number of Indigenous teachers working in schools reflect the number of Indigenous students attending schools in our community. This would be an important step towards better addressing what Putman, Hansen and Walsh (2016) have identified as the “diversity gap.”

**Table 5: Diversity Gap for Number of Indigenous Teachers and Enrolled Students
2013/14 Manitoba Indigenous Teacher Education Survey Report and 2013/14
Aboriginal Self-Identification in Manitoba Schools Report**

School Division	Total Students	Indigenous Students	%	Total Teachers	Indigenous Teachers	%
Louis Riel	14,343	1,628	11.4%	973	105	10.8%
Pembina Trails	12,709	783	6.2%	923	59	6.4%
River East- Transcona	16,106	2,461	15.3%	1,161	70	6.0%
St. James- Assiniboia	8,305	1,667	20.1%	619	44	7.1%
Seven Oaks	10,858	1,395	12.8%	762	64	8.4%
Winnipeg School Division	33,176	8,186	24.7%	2,402	244	10.2%
Total	95,497	16,120	16.9%	6,840	586	8.6%

Table 6: Diversity Gap for Number of Indigenous Teachers and Enrolled Students - 2017/18 Manitoba Indigenous Teacher Education Survey Report and 2020 State of Equity in Education Report

School Division	Total Students	Indigenous Students	%	Total Teachers	Indigenous Teachers	%
Louis Riel	15,263	1,998	13.1%	1,130	94	8.3%
Pembina Trails	13,920	1,127	8.1%	1,023	24	2.3%
River East-Transcona	16,497	2,666	16.2%	1,195	59	4.9%
St. James-Assiniboia	8,430	1,433	17.0%	620	42	6.8%
Seven Oaks	11,523	1,642	14.2%	835	66	7.9%
Winnipeg	33,231	9,046	27.2%	2,475	137	5.5%
Total	98,864	17,512	17.7%	7,278	422	5.8%

To have an equitable and proportionate representation of Indigenous teachers to better reflect the number of Indigenous students in the city of Winnipeg of 16.9% or total of 1,156 Indigenous teachers, an additional 570 Indigenous teachers would need to be hired by the school divisions in the city of Winnipeg based on the Province of Manitoba data for 2013/2014.

Comparatively, to have an equitable and proportionate representation of Indigenous teachers to better reflect the number of Indigenous students in the city of Winnipeg of 17.7% or total of 1,288 Indigenous teachers, an additional 866 Indigenous teachers would need to be hired by the

school divisions in the city of Winnipeg based on the Province of Manitoba data for 2017/18.

A limitation of this analysis using the Manitoba Indigenous Teacher Education Survey (MITES) data is the low response rate for this survey. In 2013/14 the response rate for the province was 57.2%. The response rate for the six city of Winnipeg school divisions for MITES in the 2017/18 report was 60.2%.

Table 7: Development and Implementation of Employment Equity Policies

Of the six school divisions in the city of Winnipeg, only the Winnipeg School Division (WSD) has an employment equity policy, produces an annual report that is presented to its Board of Trustees, and posts the annual employment equity report on-line. The WSD has been a pioneer and leader in the practice of employment equity since the division initiated its policy and program in 1993.

Table 7 provides an overview of the responses from the six school divisions in the city of Winnipeg regarding their existing commitments to implementing identified employment equity policies and best practices.

Employment Equity Initiative	LRSD	PTSD	RETSO	SJASD	SOSD	WSD
Employment Equity Policy and Program:						
2021	No	No	Yes	No	Did Not Participate	Yes
2022	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Equity Audit by Independent Third Party:						
2021	No	No	No	No	Did Not Participate	No
2022	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
Self-Identification Workforce Survey:						
2021	Yes	No	Yes	No	Not Participating	Yes
2022	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Advancement and retention reports for equity seeking groups:						
2021	No	No	Yes	No	Not Participating	Yes
2022	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
Set equity employment targets for Indigenous peoples:						
2021	No	No	No	No	Not Participating	No
2022	No	No	No		Yes	No
Is annual employment equity report accessible to the public:						
2021	No	No	No	No	Not Participating	Yes
2022	No	No	No	No	No	Yes

The key themes that emerge from the responses to the 2022 State of Equity in Education Report Survey related to the identified best practices employment equity initiatives, include:

1. Three of the six school divisions have an employment equity policy and program. This has remained unchanged over the previous year. An employment equity policy and program provide a framework for a school division to plan and monitor its effectiveness regarding employment equity goals and values.

2. The past year, only one of the six school divisions – the Winnipeg School Division – has engaged an independent third party to conduct an employment equity audit. If school divisions are to authentically engage in employment equity best practices, independent equity audits are foundational components of this process for making system change regarding employment equity.

It would be unacceptable for non-profit or publicly funded organizations not to do independent financial audits of their financial affairs. It is generally accepted that good governance requires annual financial audits that are done by an external independent third-party and are made available to the public to promote accountability and transparency. The general acceptance of the role of ensuring accountability and transparency for the financial operations of a publicly funded organization should be the same standard of expectations regarding good governance and stewardship for the human resource operations of an organization. Governing bodies such as school boards and senior administrators will not provide the most effective and efficient leadership if they only view their organization from their vantage points. School boards and senior administrators will have gaps in their understanding and need feedback channels because they won't know what they don't know.

The critical role of independent equity audits and employment systems review was highlighted by the external review report of the Peel District School Board that was taken over by the Ontario provincial government in June 2020. The review report stated, “a detailed Employment Systems Review (ESR) is an irreplaceable best practice used to ferret out barriers to equity in workplace cultures, policies, procedures and practices. Indeed, without a thorough ESR, it is difficult to understand how the Board of Trustees can properly establish accountabilities, goals and timetables necessary to conduct fair and transparent equity hiring.”

The Turner Consulting Group in Ontario has conducted

47 equity audits to date, including the Peel District School Board, York Region District School Board, Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board, City of Guelph, City of Hamilton, Public Health Agency of Canada, and the United Way Peel Region to name a few. Tana Turner, the principal of Turner Consulting, was the keynote speaker this past year for two webinars on the role and function of education equity audits sponsored by the Equity Matters coalition, 5 of the 6 metro Winnipeg school divisions, and the provincial department of education.

According to the Turner Consulting Group, “a workplace equity audit or employment systems review involves the examination of each employment policy, practice and process (both formal and informal), as well as corporate culture and work environment, to determine if they present a barrier to the hiring, advancement or full inclusion of employees who experience persistent and systemic discrimination in employment, namely women, racialized people, Indigenous peoples, persons with disabilities and 2SLGBTQ+.”

The Equity Audits regarding employment include the following elements:

- “Examination of written employment policies and procedures;
- Review of any equity-related data and documents, e.g. human rights complaints, diversity training materials, employee engagement survey results;
- Consultation with employees through an online survey and focus groups with senior leaders, human resources and union representatives;
- Comprehensive examination and identification of barriers; and
- Development of recommendations to address the identified barriers and issues.”

The Equity Audits involving programs and services include the following elements:

- “Examination of written program policies and procedures;
- Consultations with employees through an online survey and focus groups;
- Consultation with service users through online surveys and focus groups;
- Where relevant, observations of programs and services;
- Comprehensive examination and identification of barriers to accessing services, equitable treatment and equitable outcomes; and
- Development of recommendations to address the identified barriers and issues.”

3. Progress is being made by school divisions to undertake workforce surveys. Five of the six metro Winnipeg school districts indicated that they engage in annual self-identification workforce surveys. Only the Pembina Trails School Division does not carry out self-identification workforce surveys. It is promising to see school divisions making a commitment to develop workforce surveys. However, the deeper commitment to the next steps of employment equity best practice will be to undertake independent equity audits and employment service reviews.

4. Only one of the six school divisions, the Winnipeg School Division, indicated that they collect employee advancement and retention reports for equity-seeking groups. A better understanding of an equity-based organizational culture is developed based on knowledge as to whether equity-seeking groups remain working with the organization or quickly leave the organization. As well, it is important to understand the extent to which equity-seeking groups are represented within all job classifications within the hierarchy of the organization or limited to entry-level positions.

5. Only one of the six school divisions, the Seven Oaks School Division, indicated they set employment targets for Indigenous peoples. Setting targets is an intentional commitment to be proactive rather than passive in developing a workforce representative of the students and community served by the respective school districts.

6. Only one of the six school divisions, the Winnipeg School Division, indicated that they would make annual employment equity reports available to the public. A key foundational principle of employment equity best practice involves a commitment to transparency and accountability with the public. The community cannot determine if progress is being made without the public release of reports, data and information. Public access to information enables the community to play an effective “pressure and support” role in developing an authentic employment equity policy and program. Support is provided to institutions such as school divisions when equity-based education moves in a positive direction. Pressure is placed on institutions if they are not moving in a positive direction and to ensure the community's priorities are being effectively addressed.



“If there were more Indigenous teachers, more kids would be going to school—more Indigenous kids. They would have that connection and wouldn’t feel left out. They wouldn’t feel different.”

Joseph
Indigenous Youth Voice

Table 8: Selected Staff Profile – Senior Administration, Principals and Vice-Principals

Table 8 provides a response by the six school divisions for data regarding the representation of Indigenous peoples in leadership roles within the respective school divisions for 2021/22, 2018/19, and 2017/18.

School Division	Superintendents/ Senior Administration	Indigenous	Principals	Indigenous	Vice-Principals	Indigenous
Louis Riel						
2021/22	29	1 (3.4%)	41	13 (31.7%)	41	No Response
2018/19	13	Data Not Collected	40	Data Not Collected	40	Data Not Collected
2017/18	38	Data Not Collected	40	Data Not Collected	37	Data Not Collected
Pembina Trails						
2021/22	5	Data Not Provided	37	Data Not Provided	30	Data Not Provided
2018/19		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided
2017/18		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided
River East Transcona						
2021/22	6	0 (0.0%)	43	3 (7.0%)	36	4 (11.1%)
2018/19	6	Data Not Collected	42	Data Not Collected	34	Data Not Collected
2017/18	6	Data Not Collected	42	Data Not Collected	32	Data Not Collected
St. James-Assiniboia						
2021/22	9	0 (0.0%)	31	2 (6.5%)	23	No Response
2018/19		Data Not Collected		Data Not Collected		Data Not Collected
2017/18	9	Data Not Provided	28	Data Not Collected	14	Data Not Collected
Seven Oaks						
2021/22		No Response		No Response		No Response
2018/19		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided
2017/18		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided
Winnipeg SD						
2021/22	9	1 (11.1%)	94	12 (12.8%)	76	11 (14.5%)
2018/19	10	2 (20.0%)	93	10 (10.8%)	56	7 (12.5%)
2017/18	22	2 (9.1%)	91	6 (6.6%)	67	8 (11.9%)

Table 9: Selected Staff Profile - Teachers

Table 9 provides the response by the six school divisions for data regarding teachers and educational assistants. Term teachers, substitute teachers, and educational assistants are important potential sources of people to increase the pool of Indigenous teachers through initiatives to transition term teachers to permanent teachers, substitute teaching positions to permanent contract teachers, and educational assistants to become teachers with Bachelor of Education ladder programs.

School Division	Permanent Teachers	Indigenous	Term Teachers	Indigenous	Substitute Teachers	Indigenous
Louis Riel						
2021/22	1,011	50 (4.9%)	97	No Response	407	No Response
2018/19	1,104	Data Not Collected	187	Data Not Collected	513	Data Not Collected
2017/18	1,039	Data Not Collected	136	Data Not Collected	632	Data Not Collected
Pembina Trails						
2021/22	800	No Response	235	No Response	380	No Response
2018/19		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided
2017/18		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided
River East Transcona						
2021/22	1,114	56 (5.0%)	217	13 (6.0%)	364	5 (13.7%)
2018/19	1,062	Data Not Collected	183	Data Not Collected	313	Data Not Collected
2017/18	1,004	Data Not Collected	191	Data Not Collected	524	Data Not Collected
St. James Assiniboia						
2021/22	619	29 (4.7%)	119	No Response	277	No Response
2018/19		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided
2017/18	567.5	Data Not Collected	56	Data Not Collected	247	Data Not Collected
Seven Oaks						
2021/22		No Response		No Response		No Response
2018/19		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided
2017/18		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided		Data Not Provided
Winnipeg SD						
2021/22	2,282	202 (8.9%)	177	18 (10.2%)	967	58 (6.0%)
2018/19	2,001	212 (10.6%)	331	27 (8.2%)	729	45 (6.2%)
2017/18	2,534	212 (8.4%)	190	17 (9.7%)	909	52 (5.7%)

Table 10: Selected Staff Profile – Educational Assistants

School Division	Educational Assistants	Indigenous
Louis Riel		
2021/22	586	25 (4.3%)
2018/19	661	Data Not Collected
2017/18	498	Data Not Collected
Pembina Trails		
2021/22	396	No Response
2018/19	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided
2017/18	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided
River East Transcona		
2021/22	677	26 (3.8%)
2018/19	529	Data Not Collected
2017/18	466	Data Not Collected
St. James-Assiniboia		
2021/22	366	18 (4.9%)
2018/19	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided
2017/18	567.5	Data Not Collected
Seven Oaks		
2021/22	No Response	No Response
2018/19	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided
2017/18	319	Data Not Provided
Winnipeg SD		
2021/22	2,184	321 (14.7%)
2018/19	1,510	239 (15.8%)
2017/18	1,829	245 (13.3%)

Table 11: Student Profile of Indigenous Students – 2021/2022

School Division	Total Students	Indigenous Students	%
Louis Riel School Division	15,508	2,330	15.0%
Pembina Trails School Division	15,485	1,703	11.0%
River East-Transcona School Division	16,957	2,331	13.7%
St. James-Assiniboia School Division	8,311	1,574	18.9%
Seven Oaks School Division	11,855	2,371	20.0%
Winnipeg School Division	29,522	8,498	28.8%
Total	97,683	18,807	19.1%

Table 12: Student Profile of Indigenous Students – 2018/2019

All six school divisions completed the student profile section of the State of Equity in Education Survey

School Division	Total Students	Indigenous Students	%
Louis Riel School Division	15,725	2,116	13.5%
Pembina Trails School Division	14,381	1,115	7.8%
River East-Transcona School Division	16,645	2,709	16.3%
St. James-Assiniboia School Division	8,533	1,375	16.1%
Seven Oaks School Division	11,233	1,855	16.5%
Winnipeg School Division	32,281	8,625	26.7%
Total	98,798	17,795	18.0%

Table 13: Student Profile of Indigenous Students – 2017/2018

School Division	Total Students	Indigenous Students	%
Louis Riel School Division	15,354	1,998	13.0%
Pembina Trails School Division	14,437	1,127	7.8%
River East-Transcona School Division	15,294	2,666	14.8%
St. James-Assiniboia School Division	8,440	1,433	17.0%
Seven Oaks School Division	11,523	1,642	14.2%
Winnipeg School Division	33,223	9,046	27.2%
Total	98,271	17,512	17.8%

The student profile data provides an important baseline for establishing employment equity targets to address the “diversity gap” identified by Putman, Hansen and Walsh (2016) for Indigenous teachers in the city of Winnipeg. This reflects a proportionate employment equity target of the number of teachers and the number of students served by the respective school divisions in the city of Winnipeg.

For 2021/22, the student profile data indicates that 19.1% of the students in metro Winnipeg school divisions self-

identify as Indigenous, an increase of 1,012 Indigenous students since 2018/19. Almost 1 in 5 teachers in the city of Winnipeg public schools would need to be Indigenous if an equitable representation of Indigenous teachers is to reflect the number of Indigenous students attending city of Winnipeg schools. This modernized employment equity target alternative more effectively links the guiding principle of the State of Equity in Education Report that identifies the outcomes of Indigenous students will be enhanced when they see themselves more reflected in the curriculum and all staff working in the public school system.

Table 14: Required Number of Teachers in the City of Winnipeg Schools for an Employment Equity Target Proportionate to the Indigenous Student Population Based on 2021/2022 Data

School Division	Total Students	Indigenous Students	% Indigenous Students	Total Number of Teachers	Indigenous Teacher Target Reflecting Indigenous Student Population	%
Louis Riel School Division	15,508	2,330	15.0%	1,108	166	15.0%
Pembina Trails School Division	15,485	1,703	11.0%	1,035	114	11.0%
River East-Transcona School Division	16,957	2,331	13.7%	1,331	182	13.7%
St. James-Assiniboia School Division	8,311	1,574	18.9%	738	140	18.9%
Seven Oaks School Division	11,855	2,371	20.0%	829	166	20.0%
Winnipeg School Division	29,522	8,498	28.8%	2,459	708	28.8%
Total	98,683	18,807	19.1%	7,500	1,476	19.1%

Equity-Based Student Data

The 2022 State of Equity in Education Report Survey added a section for the school division survey asking about the extent to which school divisions are collecting equity-based student data.

Table 15 provides a summary of the responses for the collection of disaggregated student data for Indigeneity for selected variables including student suspensions, student absenteeism, inactive students, graduation, credit accumulation, representation in applied and academic courses, and representation in special education.

Table 15: Collection of Disaggregated Student Data Based on Indigeneity

School Division	Student Suspensions	Student Absenteeism	Inactive Students	Graduation	Credit Accumulation	Representation in Applied and Academic Courses	Representation in Special Education
Louis Riel	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Pembina Trails	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
River East-Transcona	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No
St. James-Assiniboia	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Seven Oaks	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	No
Winnipeg S.D.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No

The 2022 State of Equity in Education Report Survey disaggregated student data question provides a profile of the present policy and practice of school divisions regarding their level of awareness and use of equity-based data to inform problem-solving, decision-making and programming for Indigenous and racialized students. A key element of the collection of disaggregated data involves the issue of public accessibility to this data to promote transparency and accountability. The community needs to be informed on an annual basis about the progress school divisions are making on issues such as student suspensions, student absenteeism, inactive students, graduation rates, credit accumulation, representa-

tion in applied and academic courses, and representation in special education using an equity-based lens to ensure that systemic racism and decolonization is being authentically addressed.

The disaggregated data collected by the Toronto District School Board (TDSB), Caring and Safe Schools Report for 2018/19, on school suspensions provides a good illustration of how this type of data can be used to develop a deeper understanding of how Indigenous and racialized students are impacted by colonialism and systemic racism within the policies and practices of the school division.

Table 16: Out of School Suspensions – Toronto District School Board

Table 16 provides a profile of out-of-school student suspensions for the Toronto District School Board for the period of 2012 to 2018. The profile presents out-of-school suspensions declining from 5,321 in 2012/13 to 3,906 in 2018/19, a decrease of 26.6%. This profile would seem to indicate that progress is being made to reduce out-of-school suspensions of students.

School District	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17	2017/18	2018/19
Toronto District School Board	5,321	4,697	4,524	4,725	4,927	4,302	3,906
	2.1%	1.9%	1.8%	1.9%	2.0%	1.7%	1.6%

Table 17: Out-of-School Suspensions Disaggregated by Race – Toronto District School Board for 2018/19

Table 17 provides a profile of out of school student suspensions for the Toronto District School Board disaggregated by race.

The profile presents White students have a lower rate of out-of-school student suspensions than their percentage representation of the student population; Black students are overrepresented in out-of-school suspensions by a factor of 3 times more than their percentage

representation of the student population; Indigenous students are overrepresented in out of school suspensions by a factor of 6 times more than their percentage representation of the student population; and South Asian students have a lower rate representation than their percentage representation of the student population. This profile indicates that the school division needs to acknowledge and do further problem-solving on how Black and Indigenous students are impacted by out-of-school suspensions.

Disaggregated by Race	Representative of Total Student Population	Representative of Students Suspended
White Students	28%	24%
Black Students	11%	33%
Indigenous Students	0.2%	1.2%
South Asian Students	22%	10%

Table 18: Out of School Suspensions and Course Credit Accumulation – Toronto

Table 18 further disaggregates out-of-school suspension data by linking the impact of out of school suspensions to course credit accumulation.

The course credit accumulation is broken down by grade groups. Out-of-school suspensions impact the number of course credits students can accumulate, which in turn

influences high school graduation. The overrepresentation of Black and Indigenous students regarding out-of-school suspensions is a factor that will impact their chances of graduating from high school. The disaggregation of data provides evidence to the school division for focussed problem solving on the policies, practices and processes of student suspensions, especially in relation to Black and Indigenous students

Grade Level Credit Accumulation Requirements	No Suspension Credit Accumulation Attainment	One Suspension Credit Accumulation Attainment	Two or more Suspensions Credit Accumulation Attainment
Grade 9 (8+ credits)	85%	42%	20%
Grade 10 (16+ credits)	75%	32%	13%
Grade 11 (23+ credits)	73%	36%	15%
Grade 12 (30+ credits)	63%	39%	28%

The TDSB Report identifies how this equity-based data plays a key role in developing structural and systemic strategies to address the overrepresentation of Black and Indigenous students regarding student suspensions: “The foundation of this work is through a commitment to professional learning and supporting staff to examine bias, power and privilege as they relate to the student discipline process and encouraging the application of human rights, anti-racism and anti-oppression principles.”

Additionally, the TDSB Report identifies, “school administrators continue to participate in professional learning that examines bias, power and privilege, and their connection to student discipline. This learning has encouraged principals to better understand the lived experiences of each of their students, which has not only led principals to better exercising their discretion when they have an option not to suspend, but also helped them to identify, confront and remove barriers proactively to create more inclusive and equitable learning cultures.”

The TDSB Report illustrates the impact of disaggregated data collection and how school divisions in Winnipeg

can deepen understanding of the experiences of communities of students based on an equity lens. This type of equity-based data provides further information for school divisions to engage in evidenced-based planning and problem-solving with respect to issues of systemic racism within the school districts.

Findings – Faculties of Education Survey

Student Enrollment Equity Targets

The faculties of education at the University of Manitoba, University of Winnipeg, Université de Saint-Boniface and Brandon University responded to the 2022 State of Equity in Education Report Survey. The faculty of education at the University of Manitoba sets enrollment targets of 15% for Indigenous Peoples, including First Nations, Métis and Inuit peoples. The faculties of education at the University of Winnipeg, Université de Saint-Boniface and Brandon University do not set enrollment targets for Indigenous students.

Overview of Student Population in Bachelor of Education Programs

Table 19: Overview of Self-Identified Indigenous Students in B.Ed. programs 2021/2022

Table 19 provides an overview of self-identified Indigenous students in Bachelor of Education programs for 2021/22

Category	U of M Registered	U of M Graduates	U of W Registered	U of W Graduates	U of St. B Registered	U of St. B Graduates	Brandon U Registered	Brandon U Graduates
Total Students	360	150	1,541	205	157	53	350	120
Indigenous	44 (12.2%)	10 (6.70%)	Did Not Respond	23 (11.2%)	22 (14%)	14 (26.4%)	191 (54.6%)	46 (38.3%)
First Nations	16	2	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	191	Did Not Respond
Métis	28	8	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond
Inuit	0	0	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond

Table 20: Overview of Self-Identified Indigenous Students in B.Ed. programs 2018/2019

Category	U of M Registered	U of M Graduates	U of W Registered	U of W Graduates	U of St. B Registered	U of St. B Graduates	Brandon U Registered	Brandon U Graduates
Total Students	310	153	1,590	225	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond
Indigenous	40 (12.9%)	9 (6.7%)	170 (10.7%)	29 (12.9%)	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond
First Nations	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	71	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	191	Did Not Respond
Métis	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	98	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond
Inuit	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	1	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond

The 2022 State of Equity in Education Report indicates that the University of Manitoba and the University of Winnipeg had 33 self-identified Indigenous Bachelor of Education graduates in 2021/2022. Last year’s State of Equity in Education Report indicated that the faculties of education at the University Manitoba had 9 self-identified Indigenous Bachelor of Education graduates, and the University of Winnipeg had 29 in 2018/2019. It was also identified in the 2020 State of Equity in Education Report that for the period of 2002-2015, a mean average of 35 Indigenous Bachelor of Education students graduate each year from these two faculties of education. The number of self-identified Indigenous student graduates in 2021/2022 is consistent with the decades-long graduation rate at these two faculties.

The Université de Saint-Boniface reported 14 self-identified Indigenous graduates in 2021/2022.

Brandon University reported over half of the students enrolled in their Bachelor of Education program, 191 out of 350 total students (54.6%), self-identify as Indigenous in 2021/2022. Of the 120 graduates in 2021/2022, 46 students (38.3%) self-identified as Indigenous. The Program for Education on Native Teachers (PENT) Integrated B.Ed/B.A. program that is delivered in partnership with First Nations communities demonstrates the positive impact of this partnership program model in supporting Bachelor of Education First Nation teacher graduates.

Employment Equity Initiatives at the Faculties of Education

The faculties of education at the University of Manitoba and Brandon University responded to the employment

equity section of the 2022 State of Equity in Education Report Survey. Both faculties indicated that each of the respective universities have employment equity policies and collect employment equity data, however, this data is not disaggregated for each faculty. The University of Manitoba indicated that the self-identification form completion rates remain quite low and the university is not releasing this data within the university or for external partners. The faculties of education at the University of Winnipeg and Université de Saint-Boniface did not respond to this section of the 2022 State of Equity in Education Report Survey.

Comparative employment equity data indicates that the University of Manitoba and University of Winnipeg are lagging behind other public institutions with respect to the employment of Indigenous peoples.

In November 2022, the University of Manitoba released its Anti-Racism Task Force Report – Interim Recommendations. The Task Force made seven recommendations, including that “the University of Manitoba establish a process to collect and distribute demographic data to identify and close diversity gaps” (P.11). This call to action for a comprehensive strategy to collect disaggregated equity data across students, staff, and faculty would provide greater transparency to inform decision-making and to drive change was also a key recommendation of the University of Manitoba’s President’s Task Force of Equity, Diversity and Inclusion released in 2020. A key measure of these Task Force Reports will be the extent that these recommendations are translated into demonstratable change rather than just another performative exercise that does not achieve concrete results.

Table 21: Comparative Employment Equity Data for Selected Public Institutions

Table 21 provides a comparative analysis of the most recent publicly accessible employment equity data for the two universities, Province of Manitoba, City of Winnipeg and Winnipeg Police Service.

Institution	Year of Report	Indigenous Persons as a Percentage of the Workforce
University of Manitoba	2018	2.4%
University of Winnipeg	2022	6.6%
Province of Manitoba	2022	13.3%
City of Winnipeg	2021	11.1%
Winnipeg Police Service	2021	11.6%

Table 22: Job Categories of Faculty Employees – 2018/2019

Table 22 provides a summary of the responses of the faculties of education to the 2021 State of Equity in Education Report Survey disaggregated by job categories.

Job Category	U of M Total Number of Employees	U of M Total Number of Indigenous Employees	U of W Total Number of Employees	U of W Total Number of Indigenous Employees	U St. B Total Number of Employees	U St. B Total Number of Indigenous Employees	BU Total Number of Employees	BU Total Number of Indigenous Employees
Faculty Members with Tenure	29	Data Not Provided	14	0	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond
Faculty Members without Tenure	17	Data Not Provided	13	1	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond
Contract Instructors	29	Data Not Provided	59		Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond
Support Staff	3	Data Not Provided	15	3	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond
Clerical/ Admin Staff	22	Data Not Provided			Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond
Total	100	Data Not Provided	101	4	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond	Did Not Respond

Table 23: Job Categories of Faculty Employees – 2021/2022

Table 23 provides a summary of the responses of the faculties of education to the 2022 State of Equity in Education Report Survey disaggregated by job categories.

Job Category	U of M Total Number of Employees	U of M Total Number of Indigenous Employees	U of W Total Number of Employees	U of W Total Number of Indigenous Employees	U St. B Total Number of Employees	U St. B Total Number of Indigenous Employees	BU Total Number of Employees	BU Total Number of Indigenous Employees
Faculty Members with Tenure	24	1	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	0	19	0
Faculty Members without Tenure	24	3	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	7	0
Contract Instructors	100	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	40	Did Not Respond
Support Staff	21	2	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided Not		
Clerical/ Admin Staff			Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	5	1
Total	169	6	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	Data Not Provided	71	1

Calls To Action New Calls to Action

Call to Action #1:

The provincial government needs to enact legislation to address education equity-based issues involving school board governance, including:

- Election financing legislation for school boards to prevent individuals and corporate interests, both inside and outside the province, from influencing school board trustee elections; and
- School board ward boundary review legislation by an independent commission once every 10 years, similar to the federal, provincial and municipal levels of govern-

ment, to address equity-based issues regarding representation and to address the present real and perceived conflict of interest involving the current role of school trustees in the review and revision of school board ward boundaries.

Call to Action #2

Given the increased representation of Indigenous school trustees in five of the six school divisions in Winnipeg, it would be important for these leaders to have more opportunities to support each other and identify key strategic Indigenous education issues that need to be addressed. The formation of an urban Indigenous school trustee caucus that meets regularly could provide a vehicle to strengthen the presence of Indigenous voices at the school board level.

Re-Statting Previous Calls to Action Not Yet Implemented

Call to Action #3:

Educational institutions must make a commitment to public transparency and accountability regarding equity-based reports, collection of data, and policies. The community will be able to monitor progress on equity-based issues for Indigenous peoples, develop knowledge, and provide informed feedback when public schools, universities and the provincial government ensure that this information is accessible to its citizens.

Call to Action #4

The provincial government and locally elected school boards must make a comprehensive commitment to implementing employment equity and student equity policies and programs by establishing an Education Equity Secretariat within the provincial government and Education Equity Offices within school divisions.

The key commitments for school divisions regarding the development and implementation of employment equity initiatives will include:

- (1) Independent Equity Audit;
- (2) Independent Employment Systems Review;
- (3) Employment Equity Policy and Plan;
- (4) Workforce Self-Identification Census; and
- (5) Annual Employment Equity Report accessible to the public.

The key commitments for school divisions regarding the development and implementation of student equity initiatives will include:

- (1) Regular Student and Parent Survey/Census of the Demographics of the Community Being Served;
- (2) Collection of Equity-Based Disaggregated Data for student suspensions, absenteeism, graduation rates, credit accumulation, and representation in applied and academic courses.

Call to Action #5:

Faculties of education, school divisions, the provincial government and federal government work in partnership with Indigenous organizations to:

- (1) Increase the number of Indigenous peoples interested in becoming teachers by offering a job training

program for Indigenous parents and participants in adult education centres to work in schools as community teacher assistants, be provided with transition and upgrading support, and laddering opportunities into a Bachelor of Education program;

- (2) Establish a Bachelor of Education in Indigenous Knowledges degree program operated by an Indigenous academic institution that would be rooted in Indigenous knowledges and pedagogy, provide living allowances in order that students can attend the program on a full-time basis, student bursaries for tuition and books, and childcare and housing supports;
- (3) Provide access to the Bachelor of Education in Indigenous Knowledges through a laddering program from the community teacher assistant job training program; and
- (4) Provide access to the Bachelor of Education in Indigenous Knowledges through a laddering program for Indigenous peoples presently employed as educational assistants in public schools.

Call to Action #6

There has been an increase in the number of Indigenous school trustees elected to school boards in the city of Winnipeg following the 2022 elections. In order to further address the issue of representation marginalization, consensus decision-making rather than majority-rule processes should be mandated by local school boards to ensure all voices are authentically included around decision-making tables.

Acknowledgements

The youth who have shared their voice and stories for this report are high school students or recent high school graduates who were employed by **CEDA Pathways to Education for Wii Chiiwaakanak's Indigenous STEAM Camp** this summer at the University of Winnipeg. The youth assisted teachers and supported children in a variety of Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts, and Math activities that were rooted in Indigenous representation and knowledges. Many of these youth are interested in or actively pursuing careers in education as Teachers and Early Childhood Educators.

Special Thanks to the Youth Participants:

Desmond B.
Tashina B.
Dezarae C.
Dylan F.
Summer N.
Joseph R.
Kahlea S.
Kye Bryant T.

References

Chadha, E., Herbert, S. and Richard, S. 2020. Review of the Peel District School Board. Toronto: Ontario Ministry of Education.
<http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/new/review-peel-district-school-board-report-en.pdf>

City of Winnipeg Workforce Diversity Report. 2021. City of Winnipeg.

Community Education Development Association. 2009. Indigenous Teacher Education Model Research Project. (Unpublished).

Hart, M. and Rowe, G. 2014. Legally Entrenched Oppressions: The Undercurrent of First Nations Peoples' Experiences with Canada's Social Welfare Policies. In H. Weaver (Ed.), *Social Issues in Contemporary Native America: Reflections from Turtle Island*. (23-41). Buffalo: Ashgate Publishers.

Indigenous Self-Identification in Manitoba Schools Report. 2018/19. Department of Education and Training. Province of Manitoba.

Indigenous Teacher Education Model Research Project. 2009. Community Education Development Association (Unpublished).

Manitoba FRAME Budget Report. 2018/2019. Province of Manitoba.

Manitoba FRAME Budget Report. 2021/2022. Province of Manitoba.

Manitoba Indigenous Teacher Education Survey. 2013. Province of Manitoba. https://www.edu.gov.mb.ca/iid/publications/pdf/aborig_teach_report2013.pdf

Manitoba Indigenous Teacher Education Survey. 2017. Province of Manitoba. https://www.edu.gov.mb.ca/iid/publications/pdf/indigenous_teach_report2017.pdf

Manitoba Public Service Commission Annual Report. 2022. Province of Manitoba.
https://www.manitoba.ca/csc/publications/annrpt/pdf/2021-22_annualrpt_en-fr.pdf

Premier's Advisory Council on Education, Poverty and Citizenship Research Project. 2015. Province of Manitoba. (Unpublished).

President's Report to the University of Winnipeg Board of Regents. 2021/2022.
<https://www.uwinnipeg.ca/institutional-analysis/docs/reports/2022-uwinnipeg-presidents-report.pdf>

Putman, H. Hansen, M. and Walsh, K. 2016. High Hopes and Harsh Realities: The Real Challenges to Building a Diverse Workforce. Brown Centre on Education Policy. <https://www.brookings.edu/research/high-hopes-and-harsh-realities-the-real-challenges-to-building-a-diverse-teacher-workforce/>

Toronto District School Board. 2018. Caring and Safe Schools Report.
<https://www.tdsb.on.ca/Portals/0/docs/Caring%20and%20Safe%20Schools%20Report%202018-19%2C%20TDSB%2C%2012Feb2020%20Final.pdf>

Turner, T. 2021. Equity Audits. Turner Consulting Group.
<https://www.turnerconsultinggroup.ca/equity-audits.html>

United States Department of Education. 2020. Characteristics of Public and Private Elementary and Secondary School Teachers Report.
<https://nces.ed.gov/pubs2020/2020142.pdf>

University of Manitoba Human Resources Annual Report. 2018.

University of Manitoba President's Task Force on Equity, Diversity and Inclusion. 2020.
https://umanitoba.ca/sites/default/files/2021-06/presidents_task_force_on_edi_final_report.pdf

University of Manitoba Anti-Racism Task Force – Interim Recommendations Report. 2022.
<https://umanitoba.ca/sites/default/files/2023-01/anti-racism-task-force-interim-report-09-11-2022.pdf>

Winnipeg Police Service Statistical Report. 2021.
<https://legacy.winnipeg.ca/police/AnnualReports/2021/AnnualReport.pdf>

Young, I. 1990. Justice and the Politics of Difference.
Princeton: Princeton University Press